CITY OF COLUMBIA
DESIGN / DEVELOPMENT REVIEW COMMISSION
June 14, 2018
Regular Session – 4:00 PM
Minutes
City Hall • 3rd Floor, Council Chambers • 1737 Main Street • Columbia, SC

Members Present: Paul Bouknight, Robert Broom, Jim Daniel, Angi Fuller-Wildt, Tom Savory, Bob Wynn
Members Absent: Harris Cohn, LaToya Grate
Staff: Amy Moore, Lucinda Statler, Rachel Walling, Doreen Roy, Andrea Wolfe, Shane Shaughnessy

I. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 4:00 PM by Chairperson Tom Savory.
Roll call, quorum established.

Amy Moore, preservation planner, proceeded with review of the Consent Agenda.

II. CONSENT AGENDA
DESIGN/HISTORIC

1. **1507 Fairview Drive** (TMS# 11415-15-07) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes and for preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill. *Melrose Heights/Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:
Staff finds that the project complies with Sec. 17-698 of the City Ordinance and **recommends granting preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill** with the following conditions:

- The project meeting or exceeding the 20% investment threshold requirements for qualified rehabilitation expenses;
- All work meeting the standards for work as outlined in Section 17-698;
- All details deferred to staff.

2. **2428 and 2434 North Main** (TMS# 09113-13-01) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction. *North Main Corridor Overlay district*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:
Staff finds that the proposal substantially meets the design guidelines for the North main Corridor and **recommends approval** of the request.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES
Special Called Meeting Minutes
May Minutes

Recusal by Mr. Daniel from discussion and vote on Consent Agenda.

Motion by Mr. Wynn to approve the Consent Agenda to include the Special Called Meeting Minutes and the May Meeting Minutes. ***Motion seconded by Ms. Fuller-Wildt.*** **Motion approved 5-0.**

Ms. Moore noted a request in the order of items on the Regular Agenda to move item 4, 140-142 S Walker Street, to be the first item to be heard as a staff member who wished to speak on the request had to leave the meeting early.

Motion by Mr. Wynn to change the order of items to be heard on the Regular Agenda.
Motion seconded by Mr. Bouknight and Ms. Fuller-Wildt. **Motion approved 6-0.**

III. REGULAR AGENDA

DESIGN

1. **2428 and 2434 North Main** (TMS# 09113-13-01) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction. *North Main Corridor Overlay district* **MOVED TO CONSENT**

HISTORIC

4. **140-142 S. Walker Street** (TMS# 13802-20-02) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for demolition. *Shandon Community Character Area* **MOVED TO BE HEARD AS FIRST CASE**

Rachel Walling, preservation planner, introduced the request for demolition of a c.1940 duplex that is contributing to the Shandon Community Character (CC-1) Area.

A request for demolition of 140-142 S. Walker was denied by the D/DRC in August 2017. The request for demolition is being considered again as the applicant has provided additional information not included in the original submittal.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:
Staff finds that the property has historic and architectural significance as a contributing building to the Shandon neighborhood; it appears to be capable of earning a reasonable economic return; it continues to contribute to the ambience of the district as a Minimal Traditional style building; and it is not under orders from the City to be demolished, as per Section 17-674 of the City Ordinance. Therefore, **staff recommends denial** of the request for demolition.

Ben Bruner, Columbia attorney and Shandon resident, presented on behalf of Allen Rutter, property owner.

Jerry Thompson, City of Columbia Building Official, spoke on City steps and requirements for demolition of properties.

Mr. Bruner spoke in rebuttal of comments made by the building official.

Members of the public were invited to speak in favor or opposition of the request.
Seth Rose, Richland County Council member, voiced support of the request
Boyce Blanks, resident, spoke in support of the request
Brian Shufelt, resident, spoke in support of the request
Jesse Burke, structural engineer, spoke in support of the request

As no one else spoke in favor or opposition of the request, testimony closed for board discussion.

A detailed motion by Mr. Daniel to approve the demolition request for 140-142 S. Walker Street.
Motion seconded by Mr. Wynn. **Motion fails 2-4.**

Mr. Daniel and Mr. Wynn in favor of approval; Mr. Savory, Mr. Bouknight, Mr. Broom, and Ms. Fuller-Wildt in opposition.

Ms. Moore noted that as the motion failed, a positive motion is required.

Motion by Mr. Savory to approve the recommendation for demolition with the stipulation that a specific design be approved by staff before demolition is approved.

Ms. Moore stated the D/DRC does not have purview over design review of new construction.

Motion by Mr. Savory to deny the request for demolition based upon the fact that the criteria had not been met from Section 17-674 of the City Ordinance.
Motion seconded by Ms. Fuller-Wildt.

Motion approved 4-2. Mr. Savory, Mr. Bouknight, Mr. Broom, and Ms. Fuller-Wildt in favor of denial, Mr. Daniel and Mr. Wynn in opposition. Motion passes.

DESIGN

2. **911 Washington Street** (TMS# 09013-02-18) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction. *City Center Design/Development District*

Lucinda Statler, urban design planner, introduced the request for the new construction of a 5-story, 104 guest room hotel at the corner of Lincoln and Washington Streets. This is the first submittal of the request.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the proposal in its current form does not meet a substantial number of the City Center Design Guidelines, including:

- 5.3.2 Facade proportion and rhythm,
- 5.3.3 Proportion of openings,
- 5.3.5 Wall articulation,
- 5.4.2 Street orientation,
- 5.7.2 Exterior walls/ materials,
- 5.8.2. Upper façade wall materials,
- 5.8.4 Piers.

The staff recommendation is to **defer any approval of the request** until the outstanding items are addressed.

Craig Otto, architect for the project, presented the request and voiced his perspectives on staff comments. Mr. Otto requested input on orientation of the building, materials to be used, fenestration and glass openings, and wall articulation.

Members of the public were invited to speak in favor or opposition of the request.

Fred Delk, executive director of the Columbia Development Cooperation, spoke regarding the location of the property, strongly suggested communication with the neighboring businesses and the Vista Guild.

Ms. Statler said Meredith Atkinson of the Vista Guild had to leave the meeting earlier, however wanted it noted that the Vista Guild supported staff recommendations.

As no one else spoke in favor or opposition of the request, testimony closed for board discussion.

Motion by Mr. Wynn to accept the application as presented along with continued work with staff on those particulars that had been discussed at this meeting, to include specifically the street orientation, wall articulation, portion of the settings, the façade portion and rhythm, exterior walls, and materials for the upper façade and wall materials as discussed, as well as ADA access. For lack of second, motion fails.

Motion by Mr. Daniel to defer the request for a month to allow the applicant and architect to have further conversations with adjacent land owners to discuss the proposed projects and seek their input into what is being proposed.
Motion seconded by Ms. Fuller-Wildt.

Further discussion by board.

Motion by Mr. Savory to defer the request as it is felt the application does not meet a substantial number of the City Center Design Guidelines, including 5.3.2 Façade Proportion and Rhythm, 5.3.3 Proportion of Openings, 5.3.5 Wall Articulation, 5.4.2 Street Orientation, 53.7.2 Exterior Walls/Materials, 5.8.2 Upper Façade Wall Materials, and 5.8.4 Piers, and therefore the D/DRC move the application be deferred pending further development of the design.

Motion seconded by Mr. Daniel. Motion carries 6-0.

HISTORIC

3. **316-318 Catawba Street** (TMS# 08909-02-03) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes. *Granby Architectural Conservation District*

Rachel Walling, preservation planner, introduced the request for wholesale replacement of wood siding with vinyl siding.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:
Staff finds that the request to install vinyl siding at 316-318 Catawba Street is not in keeping with Section VII of the guidelines and **recommends denial**.

Sabra Fox, property owner, presented the request.

Members of the public were invited to speak in favor or opposition of the request.
Joe Wider, neighborhood association president, voiced opposition to the use of vinyl on the exterior.

Jeremy Gower of GB Building Company, contractor, spoke about the project.

As no one else spoke in favor or opposition of the request, testimony closed for board discussion.

Motion by Mr. Broom to deny the request to install vinyl siding at 316-318 Catawba Street as it is not in keeping with Section VII of the guidelines.
Motion seconded by Mr. Daniel. **Motion passes 6-0.**

4. **140-142 S. Walker Street** (TMS# 13802-20-02) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for demolition. *Shandon Community Character Area*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:
Staff finds that the property has historic and architectural significance as a contributing building to the Shandon neighborhood; it appears to be capable of earning a reasonable economic return; it continues to contribute to the ambience of the district as a Minimal Traditional style building; and it is not under orders

MOVED TO BE HEARD AS FIRST CASE

from the City to be demolished, as per Section 17-674 of the City Ordinance. Therefore, **staff recommends denial** of the request for demolition.

IV. OTHER BUSINESS

Update to the Architectural Survey – Historic Resource Survey
Introduction of Megan McNish, preservation planner

V. ADJOURN

There being no further business, motion to adjourn by Mr. Daniel.
Motion seconded by Mr. Broom. **Meeting adjourned at 6:11PM.**

Chairperson

12 July 2018
Date

Respectfully submitted
Planning and Development Services Department