CITY OF COLUMBIA
DESIGN / DEVELOPMENT REVIEW COMMISSION
August 8, 2019
Regular Session – 4:00 PM
Minutes
City Hall • 3rd Floor, Council Chambers • 1737 Main Street • Columbia, SC

Members Present: Paul Bouknight, Bob Broom, Harris Cohn, Ashley Johnson, Michel Moore, Tom Savory, Angi Fuller Wildt
Members Absent: Robert Wynn
Staff: Lucinda Statler, Rachel Walling, Megan McNish, Andrea Wolfe, John Fellows

I. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting was called to order at 4:11 PM by chairperson Tom Savory. Roll call, quorum established.

Lucinda Statler, Urban Design Planner, stated no changes had been made to the agenda since publication. She then proceeded with review of the Consent Agenda.

II. CONSENT AGENDA

DESIGN/HISTORIC

1. **1200 Fairview Drive** (TMS# 11414-20-08) Request for preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill. *Melrose Heights/ Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the project at 1200 Fairview Drive complies with Sec. 17-698 of the City Ordinance and **recommends granting preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill** with the following conditions:

- The project meeting or exceeding the 20% investment threshold requirements for qualified rehabilitation expenses;
- All work meeting the standards for work as outlined in Section 17-698;
- All details deferred to staff.

2. **1230 Pendleton Street** (TMS# R11304-08-04) Request for preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill. *National Register Structure/ City Center/ Design Development District*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the project generally complies with Sec. 17-698 of the City Ordinance and **recommends preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill** with the following conditions:

- The project meeting or exceeding the 20% investment threshold requirements for qualified rehabilitation expenses;
- All work meeting the standards for work as outlined in Section 17-698;
- all details, including any potential new signage, deferred to staff.

3. **121 Lincoln Street** (TMS# 08913-08-03) Request for preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill. *Whaley Street Protection Area*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the project generally complies with Sec. 17-698 of the City Ordinance and **recommends preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill** with the following conditions:

- The project meeting or exceeding the 20% investment threshold requirements for qualified rehabilitation expenses;

- All work meeting the standards for work as outlined in Section 17-698;
- All details deferred to staff.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES
July Minutes

Motion by Mr. Cohn to approve the Consent Agenda and the meeting minutes. Motion seconded by Ms. Fuller Wildt. Motion approved 7-0.

III. REGULAR AGENDA

Recusal from vote or discussion by Mr. Bouknight who left Council Chambers.

DESIGN

1. **1300 block Taylor, 1501 Sumter** (TMS# 09014-06-02, 09014-09-08) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for signage; appeal to staff decision. *City Center/Design Development District*

Ms. Statler introduced the request for new signage for Prisma Health, which is replacing Palmetto Health.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff finds that the request for internally-illuminated signs E02.03 and E02.14 are justifiable exceptions to the City Center Design Guideline *6.2.2 materials*, as they are directional signs to the emergency room and will not set a precedent for future signage. **Staff recommends approval** of the request.

Staff finds that signs E03.03, E03.19. and E03.04 do not meet the City Center Design Guideline *6.2.2 materials*, is not consistent with past staff decisions for directional signage, and **recommends denial** of the request to avoid setting a precedent for future decisions.

Chuck Solomon, facilities manager for Prisma Health/project manager, provided background on the request.

Wayne Hance, Image Resource Group, created the sign branding across the state. Mr. Hance spoke on the signage materials and lighting, and upgrades in landscaping.

As no one spoke in favor or opposition of the request, testimony closed for board discussion.

Mr. Savory requested the motion reference the extenuating circumstances, for concern of precedence, that this request is for a hospital.

Motion by Ms. Johnson that in accordance with Section 6.22 of the Urban Design District Guidelines, the designated signs E02.03, E02.14, E03.03, E03.19, and E03.04 be approved by the D/DRC as justifiable exceptions to the City Center Guidelines as enumerated in Section 6.22 Materials as this is a hospital and certain extenuating circumstances make it justifiably acceptable to add the directional signage and directional signs as submitted by the applicant Palmetto Health Baptist Prisma.

Motion restated by Ms. Johnson for clarification.

In light of the fact that the D/DRC was provided with consideration of directional signs for the 1300 block Taylor, 1501 Sumter block; in accordance with the City Center Design Guidelines

Section 6.22 Materials, that the D/DRC approve the signs as submitted by the applicant without any revisions as there are extenuating circumstances that this is a hospital. And in light of the same, the directional signage and the directional signs should be permitted to proceed in the manner applied for as its continuity would assist in people utilizing the hospital and knowing where to go. Therefore, in light of that, Ms. Johnson moves that as submitted by the applicants, the D/DRC approve those signs.

Motion seconded by Mr. Cohn and Mr. Broom. Motion passes 6-0.

Mr. Bouknight returned at 4:50PM to sit on the D/DRC for the remainder of the meeting. Quorum returned to seven members

2. **20 Governor's Hill** (TMS# 0901007-11) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction. *City Center Design/ Development District*

Ms. Statler introduced the request for new construction.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:
Staff finds that the proposed design does not meet a substantial number of the guidelines for City Center, and **recommends deferral** of the request until the following guidelines are addressed:
5.3.2 Façade Proportion and Rhythm
5.3.4 Horizontal Rhythms/Alignment of Architectural Elements
5.3.5 Wall Articulation
5.3.6 Roofs and Upper Story Details
5.7.2 Exterior Walls/ Materials

Matt Davis, Davis Architecture presented the request on behalf of the property owners, the Prices.

Mr. Davis addressed the five points of staff recommendations.

Members of the public were invited to speak in favor or opposition of the request.

Ryan Oates of McCabe, Trotter and Beverly, spoke on behalf of the Governor's Hill Homeowner Association as his firm acts as the outside general counsel for the incorporated association. Homeowners' associations have architectural review associations as well, and Governor's Hill received an application for its own design process last week. The Governor's Hill board and architectural review association support comments made regarding the application as some of the same criteria is reviewed, however have covenants and rules that must be met as well. It is felt that the proposed contemporary design does not fit in Governor's Hill.

Ashby Gressette, Governor's Grant resident, voiced concerns with the design of the request and suggested deferral of the request.

Will South, home owner's association representative, voiced opposition to the request.

Mr. Davis stated he had spoken to the property owners about possible deferral of the request and felt a compromise could be reached that would satisfy all involved regarding the proposal.

As no one else spoke in favor or opposition of the request, testimony closed for board discussion.

Motion by Mr. Cohn to defer the applicant's request for design approval at 20 Governor's Hill based on the design not meeting a substantial number of the City guidelines such as Section 5.3.2 Façade Proportion and Rhythm; 5.3.4 Horizontal Rhythms/Alignment of Architectural Elements; 5.3.5 Wall Articulation; 5.3.6 Roofs and Upper Story Details; and 5.7.2 Exterior Walls/ Materials.

Motion seconded by Ms. Fuller Wildt. Motion passes 6-1 with Mr. Broom in opposition.

As there were legal matters for discussion**, motion by Ms. Fuller Wildt to move into Executive Session at 5:20PM.**

Motion seconded by Mr. Cohn. Motion approved 7-0.

IV. OTHER BUSINESS

- Executive Session

  The receipt of legal advice where the legal advice relates to a pending, threatened, or potential claim, pursuant to S.C. Code Section 30-4-70(a)(2).
  - Bullstreet Development, LLC vs. City of Columbia Design/ Development Review Commission
  - General Federation of Women's Clubs of South Carolina vs. City of Columbia Design/ Development Review Commission

Mr. Cohn left Executive Session at 5:40PM, and Mr. Bouknight left Executive Session at 6:00PM. Quorum was still retained.

Motion to come out of Executive Session by Ms. Johnson who stated that no action was taken while in Executive Session.

Motion seconded by Mr. Broom. Motion approved 5-0.

V. ADJOURN

There being no further business, motion to adjourn by Ms. Fuller Wildt.
Motion seconded by Ms. Johnson. Meeting adjourned at 6:12PM.

Chairperson 12 Sep 2019
Date

Respectfully submitted
Planning and Development Services Department